



Document No.:
Receiving Date:
(For APFNet Secretariat)

*Asia-Pacific Network for Sustainable Forest Management
and Rehabilitation*

Completion Report

**Project “Demonstration of capacity building of forest restoration
and sustainable forest management in Vietnam”**

PHU THO SUB-DEPARTMENT OF FORESTRY

March 2013

Project Title(ID)	Demonstration of capacity building of forest restoration and sustainable forest management in Vietnam	
	Approved	Actual
Date of commence	August 2010	September 2010
Date of completion	September 2012	December 2012
Extension period	03 months	03 months
Project Budget (in USD): 585,750		
APFNet's Grant (in USD)	499,750	439,750
Counterpart Contribution (in USD)	86,000	86,000
Supervisory Agency	Phu Tho Department of Agriculture and Rural Development	
Project Executing Agency	Phu Tho Sub-Department of Forestry	
Project Director	Phung Van Vinh	
<p>Project description:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Establishment of 100 hectares of pilot models of best practices in restoration of poor secondary natural forests to enhance ecological and economic values of two districts in Phu Tho provinces • Development of institutional and policy frameworks for increasing participation of 02 local communities in forest management planning, implementation and benefit sharing to sustainable forest management purpose • Enhance of capacity in forest management planning implementation of local forest 		

management institutions (Forestry Department at provincial level, commune and district forestry divisions), forest owners and participatory communities.

Prepared and Submitted by

Reviewed and Endorsed by

Project Director signature Date

Project Steering Committee Chair signature
Date

Note: The undersigned acknowledge they have reviewed the Project Completion Report and agree with the approach it presents. Changes to this Project Completion Report will be coordinated with and approved by the undersigned or their designated representatives.

FOR APFNET USE

Reviewed and comments by

Reviewed and comments by

ED signature Date

PO signature Date

Basic Project Information

Executive Summary (max 1 page)

The project “Demonstration of capacity building of forest restoration and sustainable forest management in Vietnam” with APFNet’s granted 499,750 USD was started from September 2010. Project Executive Agency is Phu Tho Sub-department of Forestry. Project duration was extended 03 months and ended by 31 December 2012.

Project has synthesized and applied best practices on forest restoration, sustainable forest management and community development in Vietnam in piloting forest restoration and management for two ethnic minority communities in two districts of Phu Tho province. Although facing challenges of undeveloped infrastructure system, high poverty of local communities and animal free-grazing custom, with high efforts of project’s counterparts, introduction of training and practices on the locality’s shortages the project has achieved almost all designed targets. 100 hectares of severely degraded secondary forests were enriched by using 06 native NTFP species and 05 native timber tree successfully. The tree and NTFP on established models are growing well and promising to provide sort and long term economic values and ecosystem services. Local communities and farmers were directly involved in the project activities by well-established participatory approach in community forest management in Vietnam. Micro-institutional structure on community based forest management was established in two piloting villages. A number of community meetings, technical documents, training courses and study tours were successfully conducted to introduce selected best practices to local farmers, communities and authorities.

There were some shortages of project’s design and implementation are including i) project’s site – particularly communities involved in the project should be carefully selected on the basis of a suitable criteria; ii) project’s personnel capacity, especially Executive Agency, should be enhanced before starting the project by internal and/or external human resources; iii) project management and supporting structure should be designed in which APFNet is more engaged in project management and implementation through the Technical Assistance Team.

The project has very positive impacts on forest restoration and sustainable management in both field cases and theoretical development in Phu Tho and other nearby provinces as well as Vietnam. The best practices on forest restoration and sustainable management are directly practiced by local farmers and communities. Capacity building for local staff and farmers, short term incomes from NTFPs and

nurseries established secure long term sustainability of the project.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION.....	1
2. PROJECT GOAL, OBJECTIVES AND FORMULATION	2
3. PROJECT EXECUTION.....	5
4. PROJECT PERFORMANCE	9
5. RESULTS.....	11
6. SUSTAINABILITY.....	3
7. RECOMMENDATIONS.....	3
8. Annexes:.....	5

[Annex A: Implementation schedule](#)

Annex B Details of project cost by category(anticipated versus actual) **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Annex C Performance rating sheet..... 7

1. INTRODUCTION

Vietnam is developing economy with low rate of labor forces working in industries and services, while dense population and population is increasing with high rate in mountainous regions presents high demands in foods, housing and livelihood improvement. Natural forests, even degraded areas, are still destroyed, over logged and converted to cultivation of agricultural crops, industrial trees or grazing land. Ecological functions of forests such as catchment protection, biodiversity... have been critically reduced. Natural disasters which caused by deforestation and forest degradation have been occurring with higher intensity and more damaged

How to protect, restore and develop sustainably poor – secondary forests to increase ecological services as well as to meet the demanding of livelihood improvement of local communities are one of the most essential issues in sustainable forest management in Vietnam. Over last three decades, Vietnamese government with the supports of international communities have implemented number of projects on forest restoration and management. In which, many technical and management problems have been resolved such as silvicultural restoration techniques, enrichment planting, non-timber forest product (NTFP) species planting and management, agro-forestry.

However, applying integrated approach of technical and policy development achievements in forestry are rare in Vietnam, especially in two proposed districts, Thanh Son and Tan Son where the most of local farmers are two ethnic minority groups Muong and Dao. This project is designed to apply integrated achievements of other projects/ programs to mentioned communities to sustainably restore and manage 100 ha of secondary degraded natural forest of these two communities and to contribute to poverty reduction and livelihood improvement for local ethnic communities nearby forests.

Moreover, although natural forests have been degraded, many secondary forests are still high in biodiversity, high growth rate of timber or high rate of carbon sequestration as well as protection function of catchment and soil, Vietnamese government has tried to establish a system of special use and protection forests for maintenance and improvement of ecological services of

forests. However, these efforts have not successfully restricted forest degradation due to high demanding of forestry land for agricultural crops. Thus, critical needs are to develop innovative approaches in forest management to ensure that forests will not be ecologically degraded as well as sustainably contribute to socio – economic development of the country.

Target groups of the proposed project are communities in Phu Tho province – where 28 of ethnic minorities are living. In which 02 communities of Muong and Dao ethnic minority group will be directly invested in forest species planting, forest restoration, protection and management, and agro-forestry. Degraded natural forests are being managed by these communities are more than one thousand ha. It is expected that 20 other nearby communities of other ethnic minorities in Phu Tho and other provinces will be technical assisted through training, technique and experience sharing and communication of the project.

2. PROJECT GOAL, OBJECTIVES AND FORMULATION

2.1. Project Goal

- Establishment of pilot models of best practices in restoration of poor secondary natural forests to enhance ecological and economic values of two districts in Phu Tho provinces
- Development of institutional and policy frameworks for increasing participation of local communities in forest management planning, implementation and benefit sharing to sustainable forest management purpose
- Enhance of capacity in forest management planning implementation of local forest management institutions (Forestry Department at provincial level, commune and district forestry divisions), forest owners and participatory communities

2.2 Project Objectives

To enhance contribution of forests on hunger elimination, poverty alleviation, environmental services and livelihood improvement

Specific objectives:

- Increase and diversifying forest products through planting non timber forest product species in the forest
- Increase long term economic values of natural forests through timber composition improvement
- Enhance local capacity on production of market - oriented forest products
- Contribute to improve livelihood of local communities
- Produce equal opportunities for local households, individuals in the project area to access technical forestry services and forest product market
- Enhance ecological services including carbon sequestration, catchment and soil protection, biodiversity conservation by minimizing forest degradation and sustainable forest management
- Strengthen personal capacity to local institutions, farmers' understanding in forest restoration and management, and NTFP processing

2.3 Project Designing

Project management and implementation structure:

The Project Steering Committee including senior officers of Vietnam Administration of Forestry, Phu Tho Department of Agriculture and Rural Development is established to give policy guidance, endorse budgets and reports and in general terms make sure that the Project fulfills its targets and contributes to socio-economic development in accordance with project objectives and activities as agreement between APFNet and the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD).

The Project Management Board (PMB) is established on the existing personnel resources of Phu Tho Sub-Department of Forestry. PMB is responsible

to activities of the project including model establishment, administration and budget disbursement.

Vietnamese Academy of Forest Sciences - VAFS (former: Forest Science Institute of Vietnam) is the technical partner which is responsible to provide major technical assistance to PMB and project communities.

There is an internal monitoring and evaluation mechanism under Phu Tho DARD and PMB and VAFS.

Project arrangement to address project's issues:

Phu Tho's a province close to Ha Noi and has high pressure on conversion of natural forest resources to monoculture exotic plantations for pulp mills in the province, while a minimum level of natural forests of the province was defined for protection purposes (water catchment, soil erosion, biodiversity) need to be maintained and developed. How to maintain and enrich the poor - degraded forests but increase the income of local communities from these secondary forests is the principle matter to be solved. The Vietnam forestry sector selected Phu Tho province to conduct this APFNet project for these reasons.

Phu Tho Sub-department of Forestry is the major authority responsible to forest resources management and development in the province. It has been selected as Executive Agency of the project. However, the sub-department and it's staff have not been conducted any ODA projects more than 10 years ago since its establishment. Inexperience in international procedure while low English capability make it difficult in project management and implementation.

Vietnamese Academy of Forest Sciences - VAFS (Former: Forest Science Institute of Vietnam, specially, Silviculture Research Institute (SRI) – an institute belong to VAFS, has conducted a number of studies on restoration of natural forest resources by enhancing forest composition by valuable timber and NTFP species with successful models and lessons learned. VAFS (mainly SRI) agreed to support Executive Agency in project implementation through strengthening local capacity on technical matters and project management as the Academy has much experience on ODA project implementation. Additionally, with a number of researchers graduated oversea, VAFS (SRI) has helped EA much in communication and coordination with the donor – APFNet and other international counterparts.

3. PROJECT EXECUTION

3.1 Start-up

APFNet announced approval of the grant of 499,750 USD for this project early 2010. The Minister of MARD approved project document on July with counterpart contribution 47,000 USD in cash and 39,000 USD in kind. The project agreement was then developed and signed between APFNet & MARD on July. The real activities of the project were started from late August 2010 after the nomination of national consultants approved by APFNet.

Project Management Board was established on August 2010. A technical assistance contract was signed between PMB & VAFS to establish technical team.

The key personnel of the project are including PMB members, field technical staff and technical assistance team. Their roles are briefly described as mentioned in section 2.3 above.

Financial procedure was fully followed current policies of Vietnamese Government on ODA project management and APFNet's regulations. The Project Management board are fully in charge of financial management of the project which includes project account, accounting management, financial reporting, monitoring and evaluation, payment inspection with state treasury.

The project inception plan was developed by PMB with assistance of TA team and approved by APFNet on October 2010. Next overall and two annual plans were delayed in submission for a period of time due to difference between format requirement of Vietnamese Government and APFNet. Although almost all activities were implemented according to project design this late approval had some negative impacts on administrative procedure of the project, especially communication between APFNet and project's counterparts.

Project reporting was based on requirement of APFNet, Phu Tho DARD and MARD. Internal technical reports of TA team were prepared on the basis of their duties given monthly.

The major problem occurred during the project start up is the withdrawal of Mac community of Thuong Cuu commune, Thanh Son district when the site preparation for pilot models and CFM activities of the first year were already conducted. Sinh Tan village was selected latter as one of two communities deeply involved in the project. However, this village is one of the most difficult community in Phu Tho province in a number of socio-economic aspects including infrastructure system, high rate of poverty, undeveloped cultivation and grazing customs etc. This made project facing many difficulties to fulfill its designed targets.

3.2 Implementation schedule

Due to change in project's communities after 07 months since it's started the activities of the first planning year, particularly pilot model establishment were only finished in September 2011. The project has fulfilled these all shortage and complete almost activities.

Below are activities were implemented as scheduled:

Output 1.1: Establishment of 50 ha of pilot models of planting NTFP species in forests and 500 clumps of bamboo species: completed by August 2012

Output 1.2: Establishment of 50 ha of pilot models of forest restoration by improvement thinning and enrichment planting by high value timber specie: completed by August 2012

Output 1.3: Development and distribution of technical handbooks, leaflets on restoration silviculture techniques, growing techniques of non-timber forest product and high value timber species, forest protection and non-timber forest product processing: completed by August 2012.

Developing village regulations on forest protection and forest product benefit sharing: completed by August 2012

Output 1.4: Conducting training courses and study tours on restoration silviculture techniques, growing techniques of non-timber forest product and high value timber species, forest protection and non-timber forest product processing: Completed by August 2012.

Other extended activities: Establishment of 04 micro-nurseries and produce seedlings, implementation of additional 06 training courses and a study tour to China: completed by December 2012

Activities have not been fulfilled and reasons:

Establishing village forestry development fund: not yet decided by districts's authorities. It dues to existing policy of the Government to limit establishment of funds which might bring negative impacts on socio-economic and security of locality and/or the country.

Final project workshop: it should only be conducted during final evaluation of the APFNet.

Project auditing: it should only be conducted after almost of financial procedures completed under the Government policy and APFNet regulations

3.3 Extension

A key strategy of APFNet is to get projects' outputs disseminated widely in English and thus have both regional and local impacts. It is requested to use remaining budget not used for international consultant costs for compiling, editing and translating technical documents and reports into English as well as produce documentary films and other public media means to deliver nationwide. The technical assistance partner of the project – Vietnamese Academy of Forest Sciences (VAFS)/Silviculture Research Institute (SRI) is the leading research and extension organization in forestry sector in Vietnam. VAFS/SRI published few hundreds of publications annually including a number of international books and papers. VAFS/SRI had strong collaboration with institutions, public media means to produce films, media campaigns, leaflets, brochures... to expand its research achievements. It is requested by the Vietnamese counterparts of the project that APFNet considers this proposal and approve

A detailed plan and budget for this proposal to be submitted during APFNet mission.

3.4 Procurement, consultant hiring and service contracting

Procurement of equipments, seedlings & fertilizers: all equipments, seedlings and fertilizers were procured strictly following rules/regulations and procedure of the Government policy on ODA project's management. The same procedure was applied for selection other services including car rental, printing, publishing and workshop means etc. The main criteria for selecting goods and services are i) the service providers are qualified to provide good/services; ii) the qualified service providers are selected on the basis of competitive price.

National consultants were selected by demands of ToR for positions presented in the project document, qualifications and experiences. Additionally, VAFS/SRI provided additional supporting team to manage daily works in the fields.

All goods and services procured under strictly Government procedure which including monitoring and evaluation of quantity, quality and time.

3.5 Revision

There was a major change in villages participating the project. Consequences of this change is addressed in sections above.

3.6 Monitoring, evaluation and reporting

Based on log frame of the project a monitoring and evaluation database has been compiled and data inputted frequently. The PMB, national TA team leader and M & E expert played the key role in these activities. Phu Tho DARD, VAFS and VNFOREST frequently examine project implementation conducted by PMB and TA team under their M & E mechanisms.

3.7 Project Costs and Financing Sources

Major project budget lines are described as below. A surplus amount of 38,400 USD un-used for seedling procurement was use for additional activities including establishment of 04 micro-nurseries for two communities, 06 training courses for local staff & farmers. Table below is the major budget lines of the

project

3.8 Dissemination

Developed technical handbooks, leaflets, posters as project design and training courses were delivered to target groups of the project. A short news and a documentary films were made and published on public TV on project's output. A number of publication and films are being prepared for disseminating project achievement.

4. PROJECT PERFORMANCE

4.1 Performance of the Executing Agency

As designed in project document which comply with Government's instructions & regulation, the Executing Agency/Project Management Board has responsibilities:

a) Developing annual implementation and budget plans of the project to submit PSC, APFNet and governing body for approval

b) Conducting project's activities as approved plans

c) Selection of and contracting national consultants and project's procurement

d) Financial, asset and disbursement management:

e) Administrative, coordinating issues of the project, especially liaison with TA team on all technical matters of the project.

f) Project's monitoring, evaluation and reporting

g) Acceptance check, payment and project's account balance reporting

h) Other duties

It's the first big ODA project implemented by Phu Tho Sub-Department of Forestry and thus the EA faced many difficulties in implementation and management of the project. Two major problems EA facing with are financial procedure of the project under Vietnam Government policy and APFNet regulations and low rate of English proficiency of EA members. The first shortage

made project's fund is usually not in time disbursed and thus delayed activities in the fields and technical assistance resources. While reporting and communication with APFNet were not well due to its low English capability. The TA team had to play key role in reporting and communication with APFNet on behalf of Vietnamese counterparts. By implementation of this project, Phu Tho Sub-department of Forestry capacity in project management and implementation has been much improved. This is a very positive impact of the project on the development of forestry sector in Phu Tho province and the Centre North Vietnam region where forestry is one of the most important sector in socio-economic development.

Below is internal ranked result by four main points suggested by report's guidelines on EA accomplishment on different aspects of implementation of the project:

- i) ensuring allocation of the APFNet's grant and Counter-part fund: 3/5
- ii) overall managing the implementation of the project: 3/5
- iii) disbursement of funds for payment of project team, contractors and consultants: 2.5/5
- iv) progress reporting to the PSC, APFNet and SA: 2/5
- v) liaison with the Technical Assistance Team on technical issues concerning the project: 4/5

4.2 Performance of other project partners

Forest Science Institute of Vietnam (now Vietnamese Academy of Forest Sciences) is the project's major technical partner which is responsible to provide technical assistance to project management board and project communities. These technical supports are including:

- Nominate candidates for national consultant positions including national TA team leader for the approval of Project Director and APFNet.
- Provide technical services to the project such as forest inventory and other surveys, model design, training courses, study tours and handbook and leaflet production.

- Assist with preparing project documents which are including reports
- Assist with workshop and seminar preparation and implementation

VAFS's TA team has fulfilled its duties on technical matters given by the project. Technical supports were usually delivered in time. TA team has prepared and finalized all handbooks, leaflets, brochures, reports, training document and trainers for the project.

VAFS's has completed forest inventory contract with PMB to analyze impacts of the project on forest resources of two communes, especially in the pilot model sites. These supported contributed substantially to the accomplishment of the project.

However, the national consultants are part time working for the project and thus not always have time to work for the project when needed. This delay some technical assistance activities and outputs and have negative impacts on project implementation.

Other service providers were selected strictly complying with Government regulations on procurement of ODA projects. These service providers supplied in time with acceptable quality of goods and services.

4.3 Performance of APFNet

APFNet has been played very active and supportive role to motivate project implementation. All supports and fund transferred were done in time to help EA in conducting project's activities.

5. RESULTS

5.1 Achievements

Almost all objectively verifiable indicators of achievement of the project indicated in the logical framework have been achieved. The measurable indicators including i) number of qualified technical handbooks, leaflets, posters, reports developed and published; ii) areas of pilot models; iii) number of native

timber species and NTFP used for pilot model; iv) survival and growth rates of pilot models; v) contribution of short term planted NTFP on the improvement of income from degraded secondary forests; vi) number of training courses and study tours; vii) forest inventory; viii) village forest protection and development regulations were successfully achieved. Only 4.5 hectares model of *Calamus tetradactylus* has not been protected and major destroyed by husbandry animals of a household involved in the project.

In general, the indicators in the Logical Framework of the Overall Work Plan and the project objectives were achieved.

After training courses, communities' meetings and village regulation development process, the awareness of local communities and staff on SFM are raised. This improvement has been addressed in their forest protection and development regulations of the villages.

Table 2. Comparison between projects with natural forest restoration activities

Project	5 millions ha -661 national programs (1998 – 2010) (natural forest restoration components)	KfW 3 (2002 – 2011) (natural forest restoration piloting)	APFNet (2010 – 2012)
Objective	Restoration degraded natural forests	Enrichment of secondary forests	Restoration and Enrichment of degraded secondary forests
Approach	Protection Enrichment by 01 – 03 tree species per ha Enrichment by strip Extensive management	Protection Enrichment by 01 – 03 tree species per ha Enrichment by strip Intensive management	Protection Enrichment by 05 native timber species and 05 NTFP Enrichment by strip Intensive management
Scale	Large scale (many provinces)	Piloting scale	Piloting scale (100 ha)
Lessons	Low success due to unsuitable species selection; low standard of seedlings; low investment; M & E mechanism not good	Success at initial stage, Lack investment, M & E mechanism after project finished	Success by ending of the project including: appropriate selection of species for planting; suitable seedling criteria; intensive training & management; diversifying forest products by combination of NTFP and timber species

Local communities have also been learned about their roles in management of their own forests, rights and restrictions under Government policy. Farmers are keen on to improve their degraded secondary forests to have better high-valued timber tree species composition and valuable NTFP under forest canopy. This contribute to sustainable forest management of project's communes. Involvement of project implementation and get payment for labor cost and the initial products from short term NTFP contributed to increase income of local households and poverty alleviation.

Through implementation of the project, local people, project counterparts, Phu Tho authorities and Vietnam forestry sector has learned about APFNet and raised recognition on the contributions of APFNet on forestry development, sustainable forest management in Vietnam. Two forestry master students are using project's results for doing theses.

Comparison to other projects which have natural forest practices (table 2), the APFNet's project in Phu Tho province is the first development project used both NTFP and native timber species for enrichment in unique areas of degraded natural forests. Additionally, the number of timber species used of the APFNet project is higher than other projects in each pilot model.

5.2 Good stories, best practices, intelligence products

Main best practices were introduced to project successfully are as below:

- Restoration of severely degraded secondary forests by enrichment planting of native timber species. All selected native species have high growth rates, growing well and contributed to increase ratio of high value species of pilot model sites to more than 80 % compared to un-intervened nearby degraded forests.

- Most successful NTFP is *Dianella ensifolia* species which grown well in the hill sides. Harvesting of this species models have contributed 1,500 USD income in Que village and 1,000 USD income in Sinh Tan village. Other longer term rotation NTFP species are growing well and promising to provide good income to local farmers.

- Community forestry management were conducted in both villages. Local communities are enthusiastic in developing and applying regulations on forest

protection and management. A benefit sharing mechanism has been established on community forest products to contribute to sustainable forestry development in the project sites.

Synthesizing reports of case studies and policy briefing, technical handbooks/ leaflets, forestry management standard/ regulations were well prepared by TA team. This is contributing to achieve project's expected outputs.

5.3 Lessons learned

Development Lessons:

Key development lessons learn from the project design and should be taken into account are i) The project has failed in selection of the first site and two final selected sites are not really good locations for “piloting” and “demonstration” of forest restoration and sustainable forest management. It is needed to develop appropriate criteria and apply to select sites for the project. This is essential to secure project success and achievement; ii) The budget line for Technical Assistance Partner (TAP) should be directly managed by APFNet and directly transferred to TAP's account. Payment are made only on the basis of national consultants' outputs by approval of APFNet with the agreement of the Project Management Board

Operational Lessons:

There are some major operational lessons learned from conducting project are i) project's interventions can only work well at local level if local communities fully awareness of the project and willing to participate; ii) key project management board personnel whom support to the Project Director should be more careful selected to get a good team for project implementation and management; iii) supporting from Central Government are really needed in formulation project structure such as the Project Steering Committee; APFNet should assign more flexibility in selection of national consultants based on nomination of technical assistance partner and TA team leaders. This allows the project to select alternative consultants for implementation of the project in time.

5.5 Impacts

The project have very positive impacts on forest restoration and sustainable

management in both field cases and theoretical development. This is one of very few projects in Vietnam where best practices on forest restoration and sustainable management are directly used by local farmers and communities. Although undeveloped cultivation and grazing customs of two local communities, many farmers are trained and practiced skills on site preparing, planting, tending trees and NTFP, harvesting NTFP in the forests etc. A number of forestry staff were also participated training courses, study tours and field activities where they learned and improved their knowledge and skills in forest establishment and sustainable forest management. Additionally, other show cases by published materials and public media informed nationality and locality on the project and it have positive impacts to these policies and practices in Vietnam.

6. SUSTAINABILITY

As designed the project targets to combine both short term NTFP species with long term high valued native timber in restoration of the project. This would make forests intervened by the project are maintained and sustained in the long run. Increasing values of forests both long and short terms is good strategy to secure project's achievement after finished.

Local capacity in Phu Tho forestry sector and authorities have been much improved through training and extension activities of the project. Hundreds of people including key forestry staff/officers and local authorities participated in project training & extension. This contributes to sustain and extend project's strategy and achievements to much wider direct intervention scope.

Improved secondary forests of the project contribute to increase biodiversity, ecosystem services of forests in the region.

7. RECOMMENDATIONS

- It is recommended to establish an appropriate criteria and indicators to select sites for the project. Selection the right sites secures the success and expected achievement of the project and give more values to extend

project outputs to technical and policy formulation and a larger scale

- A mechanism which allows APFNet more engaged in monitoring and evaluation of the project through the Technical Assistance Partner and TA team of the project should be designed. The grant budget line allocated to TAP and TA team should be directly managed and transferred from APFNet.
- Project design should be more careful consider technical and financial aspects of model establishment such as species selection and seedling prices/costs. Longer and difficult transportation of goods & services sites are also needed to be taken into account to make cost estimation corrected.
- To inform and extend project's results it is recommended to use remaining budget for synthesizing project's achievements and experiences and compiling and publishing publications including reports, books & public media means such as documentary films & articles.

8. Annexes:

Annex A: Implementation schedule

Annex B: Details of project cost by category

Annex C: Performance rating sheet

Annex A: Implementation schedule

Output and activity	Completion time		Results	
	Anticipated	Actual	Anticipated	Actual
<i>Output 1. 50 ha of pilot models of planting NTFP species in forests and 500 clumps of bamboo species are planted</i>	Aug 2012	Aug 2012	50 ha & 500 clumps	50 ha & 500 clumps
Activity 1. Forest status inventory	Aug 2012	Aug 2012	100 %	100 %
Activity 2. Training courses/ study tours	Aug 2012	Aug 2012	100 %	100 %
Activity 3. Model design	Aug 2012	Aug 2012	100 %	100 %
Activity 4. Collections of qualified seeds/ seedlings of NTFP species	March 2012	March 2012	100 %	100 %
Activity 5. Establishing pilot models	Aug 2012	Aug 2012	100 %	100 %
<i>Output 1. 50 ha of pilot models of forest restoration by improvement thinning and enrichment planting by high value timber native species</i>	Aug 2012	Aug 2012	50 ha	50 ha
Activity 6. Forest status inventory	Aug 2012	Aug 2012	100 %	100 %
Activity 7. Training courses/ study tours	Aug 2012	Aug 2012	100 %	100 %
Activity 8. Model design	Aug 2012	Aug 2012	100 %	100 %
Activity 9. Collections of qualified seeds/ seedlings of NTFP species	March 2012	March 2012	100 %	100 %
Activity 10. Establishing pilot models	Aug 2012	Aug 2012	100 %	100 %
Additional extended activity: 04 micro nurseries established, seedling grown	Dec 2012	Dec 2012	100 %	100 %
<i>Output 2. 03 Technical handbooks, 15 leaflets on restoration silviculture techniques; 02 village regulations, 02 village funds</i>	Aug 2012	Aug 2012	100 %	100 %
Activity 11. Development of technical handbooks and leaflets	Aug 2012	Aug 2012	100 %	100 %
Activity 12. Development of village regulations	Aug 2012	Aug 2012	100 %	100 %
Activity 13. Establishment and maintenance of village forestry development fund	Aug 2012		100 %	0 %
Activity 14. Dissemination of handbooks, leaflets, regulations	Aug 2012	Aug 2012	100 %	100 %
<i>Output 4. 16 Training courses and study tours (06 additional training courses/tours)</i>	Dec 2012	Dec 2012	100 %	100 %
Activity 13. Development of training materials	Dec 2012	Dec 2012	100 %	100 %
Activity 14. Training courses/ study tours	Dec 2012	Dec 2012	100 %	100 %

Annex C Performance rating sheet

Performance Indicators	Score
Time Control	2
Cost Control	4
Adherence to Contractual Conditions	4
Adequacy of Supervision and Reports	2
Operational Performance	3
Total	

Note: Suppose X is the value assigned to each performance variable.

$3 \leq X \leq 5$ Satisfactory

$1 \leq X < 3$ Unsatisfactory

The score for overall Implementation Performance is the average of the individual performance variables.